

# BIROn - Birkbeck Institutional Research Online

Faure Walker, J. and Visini, F. and Roberts, Gerald P. and Galasso, C. and McCaffrey, K. and Mildon, Z. (2018) Variable fault geometry suggests detailed fault slip-rate profiles and 1 geometries are needed for fault-based probabilistic seismic hazard assessment (PSHA). Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America 109 (1), pp. 110-123. ISSN 0037-1106.

Downloaded from: https://eprints.bbk.ac.uk/id/eprint/24740/

Usage Guidelines: Please refer to usage guidelines at https://eprints.bbk.ac.uk/policies.html or alternatively contact lib-eprints@bbk.ac.uk.

| 1  | Variable fault geometry suggests detailed fault slip-rate profiles and geometries are needed   |
|----|--|
| 2  | for fault-based probabilistic seismic hazard assessment (PSHA)   |
| 3  |  |
| 4  | J.P. Faure Walker <sup>1</sup> , F. Visini <sup>2</sup> , G. Roberts <sup>3</sup> , C. Galasso <sup>4</sup> , K. McCaffrey <sup>5</sup> , Z. Mildon <sup>1,6</sup> |
| 5  |  |
| 6  | <sup>1</sup> Institute for Risk & Disaster Reduction, University College London  |
| 7  | <sup>2</sup> Istituto Nazionale di Geofisica e Vulcanologia  |
| 8  | <sup>3</sup> Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Birkbeck College  |
| 9  | <sup>4</sup> Department of Civil, Environmental & Geomatic University College London   |
| 10 | <sup>5</sup> Department of Earth Sciences, Durham University, Science Labs,  |
| 11 | <sup>6</sup> now at Centre for Research in Earth Sciences, University of Plymouth  |
| 12 |  |
| 13 | Abstract   |
| 14 | It has been suggested that a better knowledge of fault locations and slip-rates improves   |
| 15 | seismic hazard assessments. However, the importance of detailed along-fault slip-rate profiles   |
| 16 | and variable fault geometry has not yet been explored. We quantify the importance for modeled  |
| 17 | seismicity rates of using multiple throw-rate measurements to construct along-fault throw-rate   |
| 18 | profiles rather than basing throw-rate profiles on a single measurement across a fault. We use   |
| 19 | data from 14 normal faults within the central Italian Apennines where we have multiple   |
|    |  |

21 our detailed throw-rate profiles and using degraded data and simplified profiles. We show the

measurements along the faults. For each fault, we compared strain-rates across the faults using

implied variation in average recurrence intervals for a variety of magnitudes that result.
Furthermore, we demonstrate how fault geometry (variable strike and dip) can alter calculated
ground shaking intensities at specific sites by changing the source-to-site distance for ground
motion prediction equations (GMPEs). Our findings show that improved fault-based seismic
hazard calculations require detailed along-fault throw-rate profiles based on well-constrained
local 3D fault geometry for calculating recurrence rates and shaking intensities.

28

## 29 Key Words

30 Earthquake, fault, seismic hazard, recurrence intervals, geometry, PSHA, GMPEs, Apennines

31

# 32 Introduction

33 Active fault locations and slip-rates are the principal controls on earthquake locations and 34 time-averaged recurrence rates, but fault data are currently under used within hazard assessments 35 used to calculate earthquake risk. The need for long-term fault-derived slip-rates for probabilistic 36 seismic hazard assessment (PSHA) has been noted (e.g. Faure Walker et al., 2010; Stein et al., 37 2012; Papanikolaou et al. 2015; Blumetti et al., 2017). In particular, multi-millennia fault slip-38 rates provide an opportunity to capture a long-term record of cumulative earthquake 39 displacements covering multiple seismic cycles and avoiding the bias introduced by temporal 40 earthquake clustering. From this average recurrence intervals can be inferred for individual 41 faults. Some researchers are incorporating long-term fault slip-rates into hazard models for 42 different regions of the world (e.g. California, USA: Field et al., 2014; Italy: Valentini et al., 43 2017; Greece: Deligiannakis et al., 2018) and tools have been developed to help researchers with 44 such endeavors (e.g. FiSH, *Pace et al., 2016*). However, fault slip-rates remain one of the key 45 uncertainties in calculating earthquake probabilities (*Field et al., 2014*) and the lack of detailed 46 and accurate fault slip-rate data necessitates making assumptions regarding how to propagate 47 data collected at a single site along the length of the fault.

48 The problem of propagation of data along strike is clearly important, because what is known 49 from multi throw-rate and slip-rate measurements along single faults is that they are highly 50 variable; however, current fault-based approaches for calculating earthquake hazard do not 51 incorporate these detailed variations. Instead they use along-strike throw-rate or slip-rate profiles 52 with artificially assigned simplified shapes extrapolated from one to a few measurements along 53 simplified planar faults. This is in some ways inevitable because more detailed data are rarely 54 available (e.g. Field et al., 2014). However, detailed data are available for active normal faults 55 (e.g. Cartwright and Mansfield, 1998; Contreras et al., 2000; Faure Walker et al., 2009; 2010; 56 2015; McClymont et al., 2009; Wilkinson et al., 2015; Mildon et al., 2016a; Reilly et al., 2016) 57 and this prompts the present study where we explore the effect of along-strike throw-rate 58 variability for seismic hazard. Fortunately, locations where throw-rates vary dramatically along 59 the strike of individual faults may be easy to identify, because along-strike profiles of throw-60 rates on active faults are altered where faults show non-planar fault geometry (Faure Walker et 61 al., 2009; 2015). Additionally, the reasons for the throw-rate variations are well-understood due 62 to development of quantitative relationships between throw-rate and fault geometry (Faure 63 Walker et al., 2009; 2015; Wilkinson et al., 2015; Mildon et al., 2016a; Iezzi et al., submitted). 64 Specifically, throw-rates are increased across bends in faults so that the strain-rates across the 65 fault remain concomitant with their position along the fault (Figure 1). The geometry-dependent 66 throw-rate model suggests active normal faults have local throw-rates governed by a 67 combination of regional-scale external forces, displacement gradients along faults, and local 3D 68 fault geometry which are inter-related (*Faure Walker et al., 2009*). The model may further 69 explain much of the scatter and variations in shape of along fault displacement profiles (e.g. 70 *Manighetti et al., 2005*) and the scatter seen in maximum slip against rupture length graphs of 71 *Wells and Coppersmith (1994) (Iezzi et al., submitted*). In this paper we demonstrate the effect of 72 spatial variations in throw-rate along individual faults for implied average recurrence intervals.

73 Another factor that has not been demonstrated is the compounded impact of including detailed 74 fault geometry and throw-rate measurements for calculating modeled shaking intensities. These 75 will change because along-strike bends in the map traces of faults change the distance to sites 76 where shaking intensity is of interest; where brought closer to the fault, the intensity will increase 77 and the recurrence time will decrease due to higher slip-rate, compounding the threat. We 78 emphasize that shaking intensities at given locations are a critical input for earthquake risk 79 assessment - the first step towards the development of risk reduction strategies - and 80 performance-based earthquake design. For instance, the design peak ground acceleration (PGA) 81 value for the 'ultimate limit state' or 'life-safety' performance objective is typically based on the 82 annual rate of exceedance of 1/475 (corresponding to a mean return period of 475 years) (e.g., 83 the current Italian Building Code, or IBC08, see *Iervolino et al.*, 2011) and this will be affected 84 by distance to the fault traces that rupture. This is because GMPEs, also known as ground-85 motion models and attenuation relations, are typically used to model the intensity of shaking at 86 individual sites and across an area, within the framework of PSHA. GMPEs are empirical models 87 estimating the probability distribution of ground-motion intensity measures (IMs) - such as PGA 88 and SA (spectral acceleration) - occurring at a given site as a function of magnitude, source-to-89 site distance between the seismic source (the fault) and the site of interest, soil properties at the

90 site, focal mechanism, and other parameters (e.g. Bindi et al., 2011). The source-to-site distance 91 can be measured using a variety of metrics, such as R<sub>ib</sub> ("Joyner-Boore" distance), R<sub>rup</sub> (slant distance), R<sub>cent</sub> (centroid distance), R<sub>hvp</sub> (hypocentral distance), and R<sub>epi</sub> (epicentral distance), see 92 93 for instance Bommer and Akkar (2012). To be computed in practice and be used in hazard assessments, these metrics require knowledge of the fault location and dip. For example, R<sub>ib</sub>, is 94 95 the closest horizontal distance from the site to the vertical projection of the rupture surface, 96 which is dependent on the surface trace of the fault and the dip of the fault. Even if most modern 97 GMPEs use definitions of the source-to-site distance that reflect the dimensions of the fault 98 rupture for larger earthquakes rather than using point-source measures relative to the epicenter or 99 hypocenter, the role of variable fault strike and a change of dip along strike are generally not 100 considered in GMPEs used for hazard calculations or in the other steps of PSHA. In this paper 101 we show that detailed knowledge of strike-variable fault geometries changes calculated shaking 102 intensities, a critical input for PSHA.

103 The background to our emphasis on using detailed fault slip-rate and fault geometry data is 104 that most seismic hazard models currently used by government civil protection agencies to 105 inform building codes and emergency planning, and by the (re)insurance industry, are driven by 106 historical earthquake data and by the definition of seismic source zones, or areal sources, i.e., all 107 the points within the considered area can be the epicenter of earthquakes with the same 108 probability (e.g. Stucchi et al., 2011). This is in spite of it being known that historical and 109 seismological records are of insufficient length relative to average fault recurrence intervals to be 110 representative of longer time periods and capture the geography of seismic hazard (e.g. 111 Camelbeeck et al., 2007; Stein et al., 2012; Liu and Stein, 2016; Blumetti et al., 2017). In 112 particular, in continental settings, faults exist that are capable of producing large magnitude 113 earthquakes that have not ruptured in historical times (e.g., Liu et al., 2011; Mildon et al., 2017; 114 Hintersberger et al. 2018). For instance, in the central Apennines, Italy, the historical records are 115 restricted to hundreds of years, but individual faults have recurrence intervals of hundreds to 116 thousands of years (e.g. Pace et al., 2006; Galli et al., 2008). In August and October 2016, three 117 earthquakes Mw 5.9 - 6.5 ruptured the Mt. Vettore fault (e.g. Livio et al., 2016; Cheloni et al., 118 2017; Pucci et al., 2017; Civico et al., 2018; Villani et al., 2018), a known active mapped fault 119 that had not ruptured within the historical record but had clear evidence of meter-scale Holocene 120 slip events (Galadini and Galli, 2003; Mildon et al., 2017; Wedmore et al., 2017). PSHA based 121 on the historical record prior to these events would not explicitly include the hazard from this 122 fault, or others that have not ruptured during historical times. Other examples worldwide such as 123 the 2011 Great East Japan Earthquake and the 2010 Haiti Earthquake have had their probability 124 underestimated because the fault displacement-rates were not properly considered (Stein et al., 125 2012). At a scale larger than individual faults, the pitfalls of using only shorter-term historical 126 and seismicity data or deformation rates derived from geodesy to infer hazard have been 127 highlighted in continental settings such as the central Italian Apennines (Faure Walker et al., 128 2010) and North China (Liu et al., 2011). For example, in the central Italian Apennines, 129 calculated long-term (15±3kyr) fault-derived strain-rates in polygons with areas in the order of 130 1,000km<sup>2</sup> do not match short-term strain-rates inferred from historical moment tensors (700yrs) 131 and geodesy (126yrs) (Faure Walker et al., 2010). The short-term (700yr) strain-rates are lower 132 than long-term  $(15\pm 3 \text{kyr})$  strain-rates in some areas but higher in others (*Faure Walker et al.*, 133 2010). This leads to dramatic underestimations and overestimations of hazard for those areas 134 respectively if calculated solely from historical records (Faure Walker et al., 2010). Without the 135 longer-term view, hazard assessments will continue to be biased by the most recent events and hence risk from faults that have not ruptured in recent or historical times will not becommunicated (e.g. *Liu and Stein, 2016*).

138 In this paper, we first calculate strain-rates and average recurrence intervals for a fault where 139 data on detailed along-strike variations in throw-rate are available, and then demonstrate how 140 degrading detailed along-strike throw-rate profiles to simplified idealized along-strike throw-rate 141 profiles affects the calculated strain-rate across a single fault. We then expand this investigation 142 to 14 individual faults for which we have moderately detailed data. For our example fault we 143 show how the simplifications to the throw-rate profile affect average recurrence intervals 144 calculated using FiSH software (Pace et al., 2016). For another example fault, we investigate the 145 effect of simplifying fault map geometry and throw-rate profiles on expected shaking intensities. 146 We find that detailed fault throw-rate profiles and fault geometries can have significant impact 147 on calculated recurrence rates and ground shaking intensities at specific sites. Therefore, we 148 argue that such variations should be considered within uncertainties of fault-based probabilistic 149 seismic hazard assessments.

150

## 151 Geological Background

The studied faults are located in the central Apennines, Italy, a region of extending continental crust where offset 15±3ka landforms and sediments can be used to constrain throwrates across normal faults (Figure 2) (e.g. *Piccardi et al., 1999; Roberts and Michetti, 2004*). Evidence for the age of the offset landforms and sediments comes from tephrachronology, <sup>36</sup>Cl cosmogenic exposure dating of fault scarps and upper slopes, the timing of a change from periglacial processes dominating slopes along active faults to slopes controlled by surface fault slip, and shifts in  $\delta^{18}$ O from Tyrrhenian and other Mediterranean sea cores (*Giraudi and*  159 Frezzotti, 1986; Giraudi & Frezzotti, 1997; Allen et al., 1999; Cowie et al., 2017). Average 160 15±3ka fault throw-rates can be derived from topographic profiles across the offset slopes (e.g. 161 Roberts and Michetti, 2004). This time period covers multiple seismic cycles (e.g. Palumbo et 162 al., 2004; Galli et al., 2008; Cowie et al., 2017). 15ka throw-rates are representative of even 163 longer time periods demonstrated by calculated strain-rates averaged over 15±3ka correlating 164 with total fault throws across the faults developed since 2-3Ma, mantle SKS splitting delay 165 times, and elevation above sea-level via a power law with exponent  $\sim 3$  (Faure Walker et al., 166 2012; Cowie et al., 2013). This supports the idea that average recurrence intervals derived from 167 15±3ka rates are stable for even longer time periods. A map of the active faults in the region is 168 shown in Figure 3 with the 14 faults investigated in this study highlighted.

169

## 170 Methods

171 We show the relevance for earthquake hazard calculations of using detailed or degraded data 172 for a single fault, and then for 14 studied normal faults in the central Italian Apennines. We 173 calculate strain-rates across each of these faults using detailed measurements of fault strike, dip 174 and throw-rate. We compare the results to strain-rates calculated across the same 14 faults, but 175 assuming planar fault geometry and taking a single measurement of the throw-rate and using this 176 value to create assumed, simplified along-strike throw-rate profiles assuming either a 'boxcar' or 177 'triangular' profile (examples shown in Figure 4b). Using an example fault for each, we compare 178 the detailed and degraded data cases for modeled average recurrence intervals and annual rates of 179 exceeding specified ground shaking intensities.

Previously published data, supplemented by new fieldwork data (Table 1), of fault throws,and slip vector azimuths and plunges were used for the fault geometry, slip vectors and throw-

182 rates needed as inputs to strain-rate calculations (Figure 2) (Morewood and Roberts, 2000; 183 Roberts and Michetti, 2004; Papanikolau et al., 2005; Papanikolau and Roberts, 2007; Faure 184 Walker et al., 2009; 2010; 2012; Wilkinson et al., 2015; Cowie et al., 2017; Mildon, 2017; 185 *Wedmore*, 2017). The selected faults were mapped using field mapping, digital elevation models, 186 satellite imagery, SRTM (Shuttle Radar Topography Mission) data, geological maps and 187 paleoseismic trench data (Roberts and Michetti, 2004; Roberts, 2008; Faure Walker et al., 2009; 2010; 2012; Cowie et al., 2017). Topographic profiles across exposed fault scarps constraining 188 189 the throw-rate at multiple sites along the faults have been constructed using slope angles 190 measured directly in the field (Figure 2, see Faure Walker et al., 2010 for a review of the 191 method). At selected sites topography profiles have been extracted from DEMs constructed from 192 terrestrial LiDAR scanning (see Wilkinson et al., 2015 and Cowie et al., 2017 for a review of the 193 method). Slip vectors were determined by averaging measurements of multiple slickensides at 194 each site on the exposed limestone fault planes (Figure 2).

195 The strain-rate across each of the 14 individual faults was calculated building on methods 196 developed by Faure Walker et al. (2009, 2010). The method combines measurements of fault 197 strike, dip, throw, length and slip vector azimuth and plunge to calculate moment tensors using 198 adaptations of the Kostrov (1974) equations. To capture the local variations in fault geometry 199 and throw-rates, we discretized each non-planar fault on a regular grid with individual grid boxes 200 having dimensions of 1km x 2km and calculated strain-rates on planar segments confined within 201 each grid box. For the strain-rate across each whole fault (which vary in length between 5.5km 202 and 46km) we combine grid squares to model the non-planar fault.

For each of the 14 studied faults we have at least four measurements of throw (one fault has 30 measurements while the remaining 13 faults have eleven or less) to contribute to the detailed

205 or 'all data' case. We remove data points for the degraded data cases. For example, for the 206 Parasano-Pescina fault, we have seven data sites along the fault with values for the 15ka throw, 207 geometry (strike and dip) and slip-vector (Figure 4a). To investigate the effect of using degraded 208 data, we compare calculations of strain-rate across this fault using (i) all data sites in the 'all 209 data' throw profile with degraded data: (ii) leaving out the maximum throw point in the 'no max' 210 profile but including the other measurements; (iii-) extrapolating a single throw along the whole 211 fault in a 'boxcar' profile; and (iv) extrapolating throw along the fault by decreasing the 212 maximum throw linearly to the fault tips in a 'triangular' profile (Figure 4b,c). We present three 213 'boxcar' scenarios: (iii-1) 'boxcar-max' which extrapolates the maximum throw along the whole 214 fault; (iii-2) 'boxcar-mean' for which we integrate the throw profile to find the average 215 displacement and extrapolate this along the whole fault; and (iii-3) 'boxcar-min' for which we 216 extrapolate the minimum measured throw along the whole fault. For cases (i) and (ii) we use the 217 detailed fault geometry, but for cases (iii) and (iv) we assume a planar fault geometry. We 218 calculate strain-rates across a further 13 faults for the 'all data', 'boxcar-max', 'boxcar-mean', 219 'boxcar-min' and 'triangular' throw profiles.

220 To demonstrate the effect of using degraded data for calculating earthquake rates, we 221 calculate recurrence intervals for two of the faults: the Parasano-Pescina Fault and the 222 Pescasseroli fault. The earthquake magnitude-frequency distributions have been modeled with a 223 truncated Gutenberg-Richter relationship using the FiSH software (Pace et al., 2016). In this 224 distribution, the *b*-value describes how the number of events with magnitude  $\geq M$ , N, changes 225 with magnitude up to a threshold magnitude, above which N decreases more rapidly (Kagan, 226 2002; Jackson & Kagan; 2006). For this study, b is assumed to be 1 (following Bird and Kagan, 227 2004; Valentini et al., 2017). The maximum earthquake magnitudes (Mmax) of the truncated Gutenberg-Richter relationship for each fault have been calculated using empirical relationships
based on fault length (*Wells and Coppersmith, 1994*).

To calculate activity rates at magnitudes given by the truncated Gutenberg-Richter relationship, we balanced the expected seismic moment rate of the truncated Gutenberg-Richter relationship with the seismic moment rate obtained by geometry and slip rates ( $\dot{M_g}$ ):

233 
$$M_g = \mu LWV$$
(1)

where  $\mu$  is the shear modulus, V is the slip rate, and L and W are along-strike rupture length and downdip width, respectively. In this study, to include slip rate variability along strike, as well as detailed slip rate profiles, we assumed:

$$237 \qquad M_g = \mu \sum L_i W_i V_i \tag{2}$$

where i indicates data of along-strike segments of a fault.

The effect of using degraded data on expected ground shaking at individual sites was investigated through a site-specific PSHA. We calculate annual rates of exceeding specified ground shaking intensities at a specified site. Earthquake rates for different earthquake magnitudes are calculated as described above using the 'all data', 'boxcar-max' and 'triangular' throw profiles. Shaking intensities for given magnitudes are calculated using GMPEs.

We use the widely-applied GMPEs for Italy (*Bindi et al., 2011*) to calculate the ground shaking from earthquakes on the Pescasseroli fault at a given site several kilometers from the fault. These GMPEs are derived for the geometrical mean of the horizontal components and the vertical, considering the latest release of the strong motion database for Italy. The regressions are performed over the magnitude range 4–6.9 and considering distances up to 200 km. The equations are derived for PGA, peak ground velocity (PGV) and 5%-damped spectral acceleration (SA) at periods between 0.04 and 2 s.

251 To test the effect of using simplified fault geometries on expected ground shaking intensities, 252 we compare the GMPE results basing the source-to-site distance on detailed fault geometry and 253 simplified planar fault geometries. Consistent with the used GMPEs, we use the R<sub>ib</sub> source-to-254 site distance. For the 'all data' throw profile, we use R<sub>ib</sub> based both on detailed fault geometry 255 and simplified planar geometries. The simplified geometries use a planar fault strike projected 256 between the two fault tips and two different fault dips: one using the fault dip measured at the 257 site of maximum throw and the other using the fault dip measured at the fault tip. For the 258 'triangular' and 'boxcar-max' throw-profiles, the two planar fault geometries are modeled.

259 We account for uncertainty in the factors affecting ground motions by using a Monte Carlo 260 simulation-based approach (e.g. Assatourians and Atkinson, 2013). To this aim, a 10,000yrs 261 synthetically generated set of potential earthquakes across the Pescasseroli Fault, with their 262 temporal distribution, is developed by drawing random samples from the assumed PSHA model 263 components (and related probability distributions), i.e., magnitude-recurrence parameters and 264 maximum magnitude, as defined above. 500 realizations of random numbers drawn from the 265 standard normal distribution is multiplied by the given sigma value (variability of the GMPE 266 model) and added to the median log-ground motions (from the GMPEs) to model the aleatory 267 variability in ground motions. Site-specific hazard curves are displayed showing annual rates of 268 exceedance against PGA and SA(1s). For the 'all data' throw profile with the strike-variable 269 fault geometry, we show hazard curves of the PGA for each realization as well as the median,  $16^{\text{th}}$  and  $84^{\text{th}}$  curves (representing  $\pm 1\sigma$ ). For all the simplified cases only the median curve is 270 271 shown. In general, SA(1s) can be used as good predictor of the structural response and induced-272 damage of low-to-mid rise buildings, one of the most common construction types in Italy (e.g.,

#### 275 **Results**

276 The strain-rates within individual 1km x 2km grid boxes across the Parasano-Pescina fault are 277 shown in Figure 4. Figure 4(i) shows the strain-rates calculated using all the data. Figures 4(ii-iv) 278 show how the calculated strain-rates across the whole fault change for the 'no max', 'boxcar-279 max', 'boxcar-mean', 'boxcar-min' and 'triangular' throw profiles to 93%, 158%, 104%, 61% 280 and 78% of the 'all data' profile respectively (the bars and errors of the 'all data' case are shown 281 on each graph). The strain-rates calculated across the fault using the 'boxcar-max' (iii-1), 282 'boxcar-min' (iii-3) and 'triangular' (iv) throw profiles are outside the error margins of the 283 calculated strain-rate across the fault using all the available data (i).

284 In Figure 5, the calculated strain-rates for the 'all data', 'boxcar-max', 'boxcar-mean', 285 'boxcar-min' and 'triangular' throw profiles are compared for each of the 14 studied faults. The 286 strain-rates for each fault are normalized to the 'all data' case to allow comparison between the 287 calculated strain-rate and the scenarios modeled with simplified throw-rate profiles. For the 288 simplified 'boxcar-max', 'boxcar-mean', 'boxcar-min' and 'triangular' throw profiles, only one, 289 nine, two and three of the faults have strain-rates within the 'all data' case errors respectively 290 (errors for strain-rates across entire faults using 'all data' vary between 6% and 20%). Strain-291 rates across faults for the simplified cases vary from 51% to 303% relative to the 'all data' cases 292 and half of them have calculated strain-rates <0.5 or >1.5 times the 'all data' cases. The results in 293 Figures 4 and 5 demonstrate that one measurement of throw extrapolated along strike in either a 294 'boxcar' or 'triangular' profile is insufficient to characterize strain-rates across a fault.

The effect of using degraded data on calculated recurrence intervals is shown for the Parasano-Pescina fault in Figure 6. The different throw profiles modify the implied  $\geq M_w 5.1$ average earthquake recurrence intervals from 420yrs ('all data') to 465yrs, 262yrs and 524yrs for the 'no max', 'boxcar-max', and 'triangular' throw profile cases respectively.

299 Figure 7 shows site-specific spectral shaking for an example fault can be altered beyond the 300  $1\sigma$  uncertainty if a simplified fault geometry is assumed that does not include strike-variable 301 geometry. We show the shaking derived from using our measured, detailed fault geometry and 302 two examples of simplified planar fault geometry to demonstrate this point. We use an example 303 site, which has Rjb distance to the Pescasseroli fault of 4.6km when utilizing the detailed fault 304 trace and measurements of dip. However, this distance in increased to 6.4km and 11.3km if the 305 fault is simplified to having planar geometry between the tips with the dip projected from the 306 maximum throw site and tip respectively (see Figure 7a). Figure 7b shows how degrading the 307 fault geometry - so that the fault becomes planar - changes calculated ground shaking from that 308 fault at the specified example site by altering the source-to-site distance (solid line compared to 309 dashed and dotted lines). Figure 7c shows the combined effect of degrading both the fault 310 geometry and throw profiles (dotted and dashed lines). For this fault, the 475yr return period 311 PGA for a given site varies from  $0.23g (\pm 1\sigma; 0.21-0.24g)$  given the actual fault geometry to 312 0.20g or 0.13g when relying on simplified tip-to-tip planar fault geometries with the dip 313 projected from the maximum throw data site or from the fault tip respectively. If the simplified 314 throw profiles are added to the simplified planar fault geometries for this example fault, this 315 reduces the 475yr PGA to as low as 0.12g (52% of the 'all data' case using detailed geometry) 316 compared to the 0.23g ( $\pm 1\sigma$ : 0.21-0.24g) for the actual fault geometry and detailed throw dataset, 317 a difference that is bigger than the uncertainty on the latter. This is because a fault's non318 planarity alters the fault-to-site distance and simplified throw profiles change calculated rates of 319 occurrence. A similar result can be observed in terms of SA(1s) (Figure 7). The observed 320 discrepancies in the observed shaking intensities between simplified and detailed fault geometry 321 further increase at higher mean return periods (lower annual rates of exceedance) (Figure 7c).

322

# 323 Discussion

324 Constraining slip-rate has been cited as one of the key uncertainties in earthquake probability 325 calculations (Field et al., 2014). For example, in California UCERF3 slip-rates are directly 326 constrained for less than half the fault segments (Field et al., 2014). Detailed data showing how 327 throw-rates and fault geometry vary along a fault are rarely available. Therefore, how these 328 parameters change along the length of a fault generally needs to be inferred from just one or a 329 few measurements. For fault-based PSHA the importance of using such extrapolations needs to 330 be known. In this paper we show that key outputs from fault-based PSHA vary dramatically if 331 the inferred along-strike throw-rate (and hence slip-rate) profile is in error.

332 For our degraded data sets used for calculating recurrence intervals and ground shaking, we 333 included the data we considered most likely to be present in a less detailed dataset, in other 334 words, the long-term throw data most likely to be collected when only one or a few 335 measurements are taken to represent the throw along the entire fault. We considered the case 336 where only one data site exists along the fault and extrapolated this using 'boxcar-max' and 337 'triangular' throw profiles. In these two scenarios, we assumed that the most likely location 338 where data may be collected would be the site of maximum offset due to it being the most likely 339 site to have identifiable and preserved offset features. In addition, for an example fault we 340 studied the effect of a scenario where detailed data has been collected, but not from the site of

341 maximum throw: the 'no max' case (ii). In the studied fault, the maximum offset occurs across a 342 bend in the fault, as expected from the geometry-dependent throw-rate model in Faure Walker et 343 al. (2009, 2015), so this degraded data scenario represents a case where the bend is not 344 identified, leading to exclusion of a site of higher throw. We show this example to highlight the 345 importance of ensuring data is not excluded along locations with variable geometry. The strain-346 rate calculated using the integrated average throw does lie within the 'all data' case error for nine 347 of the 14 faults, however, for five of the faults an average throw is insufficient. We emphasize 348 that in general fewer measurements than what we have are available for calculating an average 349 throw and hence using average throw-rates or slip-rates will likely cause worse results than 350 shown. We have not determined a general rule as to whether using average throw-rates would 351 more likely overestimate or underestimate the strain-rate across a fault because it is dependent on 352 which throw-rate measurements are incorporated in the calculation of the average throw-rate. We 353 show the 'boxcar-min' and 'boxcar-max' scenarios to demonstrate the range of possible values 354 that could be obtained from using an "average" throw-rate when this is calculated from fewer 355 data points. Therefore, we argue that using an "average" throw or slip projected along the fault is 356 also insufficient for modeling hazard.

If the problems with extrapolating data are not recognized, this can lead to large errors in recurrence interval calculations. To put this into perspective we discuss how this compares to the effect of temporal variability in the recurrence intervals due to earthquake clustering. Values of the coefficient of variation (CV, standard deviation of the recurrence interval divided by the mean recurrence interval) generally used in PSHA are <0.5 as this is consistent with values computed (e.g. 0.38 (*Gonzalez et al., 2006*); 0.14-0.34 (*Pace et al., 2006*); 0.48 (*Lienkaemper and Williams, 2007*); 0.2-0.39 (*Visini and Pace, 2014*)). Half our strain-rates calculated using the simplified throw-rate scenarios lead to values <0.5 or >1.5 times the 'all data' case; this demonstrates that using detailed throws changes probability calculations beyond the uncertainty due to intrinsic natural variability.

367 We also demonstrate that if the compounded effect of using simplified planar fault geometry 368 and simplified throw profiles on calculated ground shaking exceedance probabilities is not 369 considered, this will lead to errors in values that inform building code regulations. For the 370 example Pescasseroli fault, the 475yr return period PGA is altered beyond  $1\sigma$  error and thus our 371 results are significant, for instance, to building code 'ultimate limit state' and 'life-safety'. The 372 observed differences further increase at higher mean return periods, for instance for the 2475yr 373 PGA or SA(1s), corresponding to collapse prevention in several international building codes and 374 in the IBC08. For other faults, whether ground shaking calculated from simplified throw-rates 375 and planar geometries is higher or lower than the 'all data' case will depend on both the impact 376 on the recurrence intervals and changes in modeled source-to-site distances. To what extent and 377 to how far from a fault the calculated ground shaking could be impacted by performing 378 calculations based on simplified planar fault geometry and a simplified throw or slip profile is 379 likely to be a function of how variable the actual fault geometry is. Note that local calculations in 380 shaking intensities near faults could be further altered where there are dramatic local variations 381 in fault strike. For instance, along a strongly non-planar fault such as the Fiamignano fault 382 (Figure 3), planar fault models could underestimate local shaking intensities by mislocating a site 383 from the hangingwall onto the footwall. Therefore, the non-planarity of faults, detailed changes 384 in throw-rates along faults and local dramatic changes in fault strikes could have significant 385 impact for local planning and disaster management through building regulation impacts. At a 386 regional scale, changes in implied exceedance probabilities of implied shaking (PGA or SA) will have impact on the calculated damage state and hence calculated losses in catastrophe models used within the insurance industry. To achieve high-resolution risk mapping, detailed fault parameters need to be included.

We note that a full hazard analysis could use a combination of GMPEs, through a logic-tree approach (e.g. *Bommer et al., 2005*). These should include epistemic uncertainties such as sitespecific properties and dip propagation with depth. However, in this paper we use just one set of GMPEs to demonstrate the relevance of geometry. The *Bindi et al. (2011)* GMPEs were chosen because they perform well in the region. Specifically, they performed better than older GMPEs for calculating predicted shaking intensities at stations following the 24<sup>th</sup> August 2016 Amatrice earthquake (*Meletti et al., 2016; EEFIT, 2017*).

397 Most hazard assessments (for earthquakes and other natural hazards) are at a lower spatial 398 resolution than would be desirable for planners (e.g. Pile et al., 2018); this is particularly 399 pertinent in areas with critical infrastructure and highly populated areas. Fault-derived hazard 400 maps allow seismic hazard to be calculated at a high spatial resolution (e.g. *Deligiannakis et al.*, 401 2018). However, a balance has to be achieved between increasing resolution and any 402 accompanying increases in uncertainty, so understanding how a lack of detailed fault knowledge 403 affects fault-based hazard calculations and associated uncertainties is needed. We have shown 404 herein that calculating exceedance probabilities of shaking intensities at a high spatial resolution 405 requires detailed throw-rate and geometry measurements as simplifying these can create results 406 beyond  $1\sigma$  uncertainty. Therefore, we advocate the use of fault data to increase resolution, but 407 with caution of including appropriate uncertainties where detailed data is lacking. In contrast to 408 fault-based hazard assessments, those based solely on historical shaking or instrumental 409 seismicity data have a restricted resolution because they divide the catalogue of earthquakes amongst seismic source zones (e.g., *Meletti et al.*, 2008). These are polygons drawn on maps enclosing large areas with similar historical seismicity. Fault traces are not used, but instead the polygons represent areas that enclose one or more suspected seismic sources. Earthquake probabilities are calculated in each polygon using the rate of historical seismicity (e.g. *Meletti et al.*, 2008). It is the size of these polygons that limits the spatial resolution of the hazard maps, which in turn is limited by the available historical or seismicity data.

416 We have not determined herein what spatial resolution of throw-rate data is required for 417 resolving the along-strike throw-rate profiles of faults with sufficient detail to capture the 418 variations in throw-rates such that more measurements do not change inferred recurrence 419 intervals. In terms of resolving individual paleoearthquake magnitudes along a fault from trench 420 sites, *Hintersberger and Decker (2015)* found that 4-6 observation sites were required. We have 421 used at least 4 sites along each fault in our analysis to represent the 'all data' cases for the 14 422 faults studied, equivalent to measurements with average inter-site spacing of 200m to 6km. The 423 geometry-dependent throw-rate model (Faure Walker et al., 2009; 2015) suggests that faults 424 with a higher along-strike variation in geometry would likely have a corresponding greater 425 variation in throw-rate along the strike. This might suggest that using simplified throw-rate 426 profiles is sufficient if faults are relatively planar (e.g. D'Amato et al., 2017), but not if the fault 427 has more variable fault geometry. This has not been tested, but intuitively it is clear that more 428 sites are needed for faults with greater non-planarity. To determine the required spatial 429 resolution, we need a greater number of examples of faults with multiple data sites.

Currently such detailed geometry and throw-rate data with multiple data points on each fault
is not available and in some areas it may be difficult to obtain it by ground-based field methods.
However, we note that techniques to capture such data - such as TLS (terrestrial laser scanning),

433 ALS (airborne LiDAR scanning) and structure from motion photogrammetry - are making the 434 data acquisition increasingly possible (e.g. see *Telling et al. (2017)* for a review of improvements 435 in modeling fault geometries with TLS). With increasing capabilities to measure such detail we 436 argue that as such data become available they should be used. In addition, throw-rates can be 437 constrained from paleoseismic trench studies. However, such studies need to use multiple sites 438 along a fault and consider fault geometry when extrapolating point data along a fault or input 439 into calculations like those in Faure Walker et al. (2009) so that along strike variations in throw-440 rate can be calculated relative to constrained sites.

In addition to including detailed geometry for calculating earthquake rates and ground shaking intensities, we suggest that it should also be used for other aspects of hazard calculations. For example, the effect of Coulomb stress transfer is sometimes included in earthquake probability calculations (e.g. *Pace et al., 2014*). We note that there are increasing capabilities to input fault geometry detail in Coulomb stress transfer calculations, with existing studies demonstrating the need for strike-variable geometry (*Mildon et al. 2016b; 2017*).

447 Overall, we argue that fault slip-rates are needed to inform seismic hazard calculations rather 448 than relying on historical records alone, however we have demonstrated herein the importance of 449 using detailed along-fault throw-rate profiles and detailed fault geometry for these. Without such 450 data, hazard calculations used to inform government, industry, and residents may misinform 451 about the geography of seismic hazard and hence not trigger appropriate action to mitigate 452 against future events. Our results highlight that local 3D fault geometry and local throw-rates 453 must be considered when extrapolating data from individual sites along a fault for use in fault-454 based PSHA. We have demonstrated the importance of detailed data for calculating strain-rates 455 and hence earthquake moment release across faults (Faure Walker et al., 2009; 2010; Wilkinson *et al., 2015*), earthquake recurrence intervals averaged over multiple earthquake cycles, and expected shaking calculated using GMPEs. For individual towns, multiple faults will affect the probabilities of different shaking intensities so the changes for the individual faults shown here will be compounded. Therefore, we are advocating a change in how fault slip-rates and geometry are considered in PSHA calculations.

461

## 462 <u>Conclusions</u>

We find that using detailed fault throw profiles and fault geometries that vary along strike can have significant impact on calculated hazard calculations by altering recurrence rates and ground shaking intensities at specific sites respectively. We show that probability calculations change beyond the uncertainty due to intrinsic natural variability and site-specific shaking intensities change beyond the uncertainty bounds of GMPEs. Therefore, we argue that either detailed data should be used when calculating hazard or that such variations should be considered within uncertainties of fault-based PSHA.

470 We studied 14 active normal faults within the central Apennines for which we have four or 471 more sites constraining the post 15ka throw-rate. Calculating strain-rates across these faults from 472 simplified 'boxcar-max', 'boxcar-mean', 'boxcar-min' and 'triangular' throw profiles resulted in 473 only one, nine, two and three of the faults having strain-rates lie within 1 sigma error of the 'all 474 data' case respectively. For the simplified cases, calculated strain-rates vary from 51% to 303% 475 relative to the 'all data' cases with half of them having calculated strain-rates <0.5 or >1.5 times 476 the 'all data' cases. These results demonstrate how far from the actual rates simplifications can 477 cause the strain-rates to be.

For an example fault, the Parasano-Pescina fault, using simplified throw-rate profiles modifies the implied  $\geq M_w 5.1$  average earthquake recurrence intervals from 420yrs ('all data') to 465yrs, 262yrs and 524yrs for the 'no max', 'boxcar-max', and 'triangular' throw profile cases respectively.

For another example fault, the Pescasseroli fault, the 475yr return period PGA for a given site a few kilometers ( $R_{jb}$  4.6km) from the fault varies from 0.41g (±1 $\sigma$ : 0.37-0.44g) given the actual fault geometry and throw-profile to 0.34g or 0.24g when relying on simplified tip-to-tip planar fault geometries with the dip projected from the maximum throw site or from the fault tip respectively. Using simplified throw profiles and planar fault geometries for this example fault alters the 475yr PGA to as low as 0.19g (46% of the 'all data' case using detailed geometry).

488

# 489 Data and Resources

The data used in this paper came from published sources listed in the references and new data
in Table 1. Figure 3 was made using the Generic Mapping Tools version 5.2.1
(www.soest.hawaii.edu/gmt; Wessel and Smith, 1998).

493

# 494 Acknowledgements

495 Some of the fieldwork in this study was funded by NERC Grant NE/I024127/1 and NERC

496 Studentship award NE/L501700/1. Our manuscript was improved through anonymous review

and editor comments.

- 501 Allen J., Brandte U., Brauer A., Hubbertens H.-W., Huntley B., Keller J., Kraml M., Mackensen
- 502 A., Mingram J., Negendank J., et al., 1999, Rapid environmental changes in southern Europe
- 503 during the last glacial period, Nature, 400, 740–743

504

- 505 D'Amato D., Pace B., Di Nicola L., Stuart F.M., Visini F., Azzaro R., Branca S., Barford D.N.
- 506 (2017) Holocene slip rate variability along the Pernicana fault system (Mt. Etna, Italy): Evidence
- 507 from offset lava flows, GSA Bulletin 129 (3-4) 304-317

508

Assatorians K. and Atkinson G.M. (2013) EqHaz: An Open-Source probabilistic seismic-hazard
code based on the Monte Carlo simulation approach, *Seismological Research Letters*, 84 (3),
516-524, DOI 10.1785/0220120102

512

Bindi D., Pacor F., Luzi L., Puglia R., Massa M., Ameri G., Paolucci R., (2011), Ground Motion
Prediction Equations derived from the Italian strong motion database, Bulletin of Earthquake
Engineering, 9 (6) 1899-1920

516

Bird P. and Kagan Y.Y., (2004), Plate-Tectonic Analysis of Shallow Seismicity: Apparent
Boundary Width, Beta, Corner Magnitude, coupled Lithosphere Thickness, and Coupling in
Seven Tectonic Settings, Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America, 94 (6), 2380-2399

| 521 | Blumetti A.M., Grutzner C., Guerrieri L. and Livio F., (2017), Quaternary earthquakes: Geology   |
|-----|--|
| 522 | and palaeoseismology for seismic hazard assessment, Quaternary International, 451, 1-10          |
| 523 |  |
| 524 | Bommer J.J. and Akkar S., (2012) Consistent Source-to-Site Distance Metrics in Ground-Motion     |
| 525 | Prediction Equations and Seismic Source Models for PSHA, EARTHQUAKE SPECTRA, 28, 1-              |
| 526 | 15, ISSN: 8755-2930  |
| 527 |  |
| 528 | Bommer J.J., Scherbaum F., Bungum H., Cotton F., Sabetta F., Abrahamson N.A. (2005), On the      |
| 529 | use of Logic Trees for Ground Motion Prediction Equations in seismic hazard analysis, Bulletin   |
| 530 | of the Seismological Society of America, 95 (2) 377-389, DOI:10.1785/0120040073                  |
| 531 |  |
| 532 | Camelbeeck, T., Vanneste, K., Alexandre, P., Verbeeck, K., Petermans, T., Rosset, P., Everaerts, |
| 533 | Warnant, R., and van Camp, M., (2007) Relevance of active faulting and seismicity studies to     |
| 534 | assessments of long-term earthquake activity and maximum 20 magnitude in intraplate northwest    |
| 535 | Europe, between the Lower Rhine Embayment and the North Sea. Geol. Soc. Am. Spec. Pap.           |
| 536 | 425, 193-224   |
| 537 |  |
| 538 | Cartwright J.A. and Mansfield C.S., (1998), Lateral displacement variation and lateral tip       |
| 539 | geometry of normal faults in the Canyonlands National Park, Utah, Journal of Structural          |
| 540 | <i>Geology</i> , 20 (1) 3-19   |

542 Cheloni D., De Novellis V., Albano M., Antonioli A., Anzidei M., Atzori S., Avallone A.,
543 Bignami C., Bonano M., Calcaterra S., et al., (2017) Geodetic model of the 2016 Central Italy
544 earthquake sequence inferred from InSAR and GPS data, *Geophysical Research Letters*, 44,
545 6778–6787, doi:10.1002/2017GL073580.

546

547 Civico R, Pucci S, Villani F, Pizzimenti L, De Martini PM, Nappi R, and the Open EMERGEO
548 Working Group (2018) Surface ruptures following the 30 October 2016 Mw6.5 Norcia
549 earthquake, central Apennines, *Journal of Maps*, 151-160 DOI:
550 10.1080/17445647.2018.1441756

551

552 Contreras J., Anders M.H., and Scholz C.H. (2000) Growth of a normal fault system:
553 observations from the Lake Malawi basin of the east African rift, *Journal of Structural Geology*,
554 22, 159-168

555

Cowie P., Scholz C., Roberts G., Faure Walker J.P., Sheer P. (2013) Viscous roots of active
seismogenic faults revealed by geologic slip rate variations, *Nature Geoscience*, 6, 1036-1040

558

Cowie PA, Phillips RJ, Roberts GP, McCaffrey K, Zijerveld LJJ, Gregory LC, Faure Walker JP,
Wedmore LNJ, Dunai TJ, Binnie SA, et al., (2017) Orogen-scale uplift in the central Italian
Apennines drives episodic behaviour of earthquake faults, *Scientific Reports*, 7,
doi:10.1038/srep44858

| 564 | Deligiannakis G., Papanikolaou I.D., Roberts G., 2018, Fault specific GIS based seismic hazard        |
|-----|---|
| 565 | maps for the Attica region, Greece, Geomorphology, 306 264-282, ISSN 0169-555X                        |
| 566 |   |
| 567 | Faure Walker, J.P., Roberts, G.P., Cowie, P.A., Papanikolaou, I., Michetti, A.M., Sammonds, P.,       |
| 568 | Phillips, R., (2009). Horizontal strain-rates and throw-rates across breached relay-zones, central    |
| 569 | Italy: implications for the preservation of throw deficits at points of normal fault linkage, Journal |
| 570 | of Structural Geology 31 1145-1160 doi:10.1016/j.jsg.2009.06.011                                      |
| 571 |   |
| 572 | Faure Walker, J.P. (2010) Mechanics of Continental Extension in the Italian Apennines, PhD            |
| 573 | Thesis, University College London   |
| 574 |   |
| 575 | Faure Walker, J.P., Roberts, G.P., Sammonds, P., Cowie, P.A.C., (2010). Comparison of                 |
| 576 | earthquake strains over 100 and 10,000 year timescales: insights into variability in the seismic      |
| 577 | cycle in the central Apennines, Italy. Journal of Geophysical Research 115 (B10418)                   |
| 578 | doi:10.1029/2009JB006462.   |
| 579 |   |
| 580 | Faure Walker, J.P., Roberts, G.P., Cowie, P.A., Papanikolaou, I., Michetti, A.M., Sammonds, P.,       |
| 581 | Wilkinson M., McCaffrey K. & Phillips R. (2012) Relationship between topography, rates of             |
| 582 | extension and mantle dynamics in the actively-extending Italian Apennines, Earth and Planetary        |

*Science Letters* 325-326, 76-84

| 585 | Faure Walker, J.P., Roberts, G.P., Cowie, P.A., McCaffrey K., Wedmore L., Watson Z., Gregory     |
|-----|--|
| 586 | L., (2015) Long-term strain rates as a tool for understanding the mechanics of continental       |
| 587 | extension and the importance of local 3D fault geometry for local throw-rates across faults. 6th |
| 588 | Int. INQUA Meeting on Paleoseismology, Active Tectonics and Archaeoseismology, 19-24 April       |
| 589 | 2015, Pescina, Fucino Basin, Italy, Miscellanea INGV ISSN 2039-6651 2015_Numero 27 150-          |
| 590 | 154  |
|     |  |

- 592 Field G. P. Biasi G.P., Bird P., Dawson T.E., Felzer K.R., Jackson D.D., Johnson K.M., Jordan
- 593 T.H., Madden C. Michael A.J., et al., (2014). Uniform California Earthquake Rupture Forecast,
- 594 Version 3 (UCERF3) The time-independent model, Bulletin of the Seismological Society of

595 America 104 (3) 1122–1180, doi:10.1785/0120130164

596

Galadini, F. and Galli, P., (2003) Paleoseismology of silent faults in the Central Apennines
(Italy): the Mt. Vettore and Laga Mts. faults, *Annals of Geophysics*, 46(5), 815–836.

599

Galli, P., F. Galadini, and D. Pantosti (2008), Twenty years of paleoseismology in Italy, *Earth Science Reviews*, 88, 89–117.

- 603 Giraudi C. and Frezzotti M., Inversione pleistocenica del drenaggio in alta Val Roveto (Abruzzo
- 604 sud occidentale) (1986), Mem. Soc. Geol. It., 35, 847-853

606 Giraudi G. and Frezzotti M., (1997) Late Pleistocene Glacial Events in the Central Apennines,
607 Italy, *Quaternary Research*, 48, 280-290

608

609 Gonzalez, A., J. B. Gomez, and A. F. Pacheco (2006). Updating seismic hazard at Parkfield,
610 *Journal of Seismology* 10 (2) 131–135

611

Hintersberger E. and Decker K. (2015), Estimating magnitudes of paleo-earthquakes from
multiple observations, 6th Int. INQUA Meeting on Paleoseismology, Active Tectonics and
Archaeoseismology, 19-24 April 2015, Pescina, Fucino Basin, , Italy, Miscellanea INGV ISSN
2039-6651 2015\_Numero 27 207-208

616

Hintersberger E., Decker K., Lomax J., Luthgens C. (2018) Implications from
palaeoseismological investigations at the Markgrafneusiedl Fault (Vienna Basin, Austria) for
seismic hazard assessment, *Natural Hazards and Earth Systems*, 18, 531-553, doi:
10.5194/nhess-18-531-2018

621

Iervolino I., Galasso C., Paolucci R., Pacor F. (2011) Engineering ground motion record
selection in the Italian Accelerometric Archive. *Bulletin of Earthquake Engineering*, 9(6):17611778.

| 626 | Iezzi F., Mildon Z., Faure Walker J.P., Roberts G., Goodall H., Wilkinson M., Robertson J.,   |
|-----|---|
| 627 | Coseismic throw variation across along-strike bends on active normal faults: implications for |
| 628 | displacement/length scaling of seismic rupture, submitted manuscript                          |

Jackson D.D. and Kagan Y.Y., (2006) The 2004 Parkfield earthquake, the 1985 prediction, and
characteristic earthquakes: Lessons for the future, *Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America* 96 (4B), S397-S409

633

Kagan Y.Y. (2002) Seismic moment distribution revisited: I. Statistical results, *Geophysical Journal International* 148 520-541

636

Kostrov V.V., (1974) Seismic Moment and Energy of Earthquakes, and Seismic Flow of Rock,
Izv., Earth Physics, 1, 23-40 (translation UDC 550.341, 13-21)

639

- 640 Lienkaemper, J. J., and P. L. Williams (2007). A record of large earthquakes on the southern
- 641 Hayward fault for the past 1800 years, Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America 97 (6)
- 642 1803–1819, doi: 10.1785/0120060258.

643

- Liu M., Stein S., and Wang H., (2011), '2000 years of migrating earthquakes in North China: How earthquakes in midcontinents differ from those at plate boundaries' *Lithosphere*, vol 3, no.
- 646 2, pp. 128-132. DOI: 10.1130/L129.1

Liu M. and Stein S., (2016) Mid-continental earthquakes: Spatiotemporal occurrences, causes,
and hazards *Earth-Science Reviews*, 162, 364-386

650

Livio F., A.M. Michetti, E. Vittori, L. Gregory, L. Wedmore, L. Piccardi, E. Tondi, G. Roberts,
A.M. Blumetti, L. Bonadeo, F. et al., Surface faulting during the August 24, 2016, Central Italy
earthquake (Mw 6.0): preliminary results, (2016) *Annals of Geophysics*, 59 (5), DOI:
10.4401/ag-7197

655

Manighetti, I., M. Campillo, C. Sammis, P.M. Mai and G. King, (2005). Evidence of self-similar,
triangular slip distributions on earthquakes: Implications for earthquakes and fault mechanics. *Journal of Geophysical Research*. 110, B05302.

659

McClymont A.F., Villamor P. and Green A.G. (2009) Fault displacement accumulation and slip rate variability within the Taupo Rift (New Zealand) based on trench and 3-D ground-penetrating radar data, *Tectonics* 28 (4), DOI: 10.1029/2008TC002334

663

Meletti C., Galadini F., Valensise G., Stucchi M., Basili R., Barba S., Boschi E., (2008) A
seismic source zone model for the seismic hazard assessment of the Italian territory, *Tectonophysics*, 450, 1-4, 85-108

| 668 | Meletti C., Visini F., D'Amico V., Rovida A. (2016), Seismic Hazard in Central Italy and the |
|-----|--|
| 669 | 2016 Amatrice earthquake, Annals of Geophysics, 59 DOI: 10.4401/AG-7248                      |
|     |  |

Mildon Z.K., Roberts G., Faure Walker J.P., Iezzi F. (2017), Coulomb stress transfer and fault
interaction over millennia on non-planar active normal faults: the Mw 6.5-5.0 seismic sequence
of 2016-2017, central Italy, *Geophysical Journal International* 210 (2) 1206-1218

674

- 675 Mildon Z.K., Roberts G., Faure Walker J.P., Wedmore L., McCaffrey K. (2016a) Active normal
- 676 faulting during the 1997 seismic sequence in Colfiorito, Umbria: Did slip propagate to the 677 surface? *Journal of Structural Geology* 91 102-113

678

- 679 Mildon Z.K., Toda S., Faure Walker J.P., Roberts G. (2016b), Evaluating models of Coulomb
- 680 stress transfer is variable fault geometry important? *Geophysical Research Letters* 43

681

Mildon Z. K., (2017) The link between earthquakes and structural geology; the role of elapsed
time, 3D geometry and stress transfer in the central Apennines, Italy. *Doctoral thesis, UCL (University College London)*

685

Morewood N.C. and Roberts G.P., (2000) The geometry, kinematics and rates of deformation
within an en echelon normal fault boundary, central Italy, Journal of Structural Geology, 22,
1027-1047

- Pace, B., L. Peruzza, G. Lavecchia, and P. Boncio (2006). Layered seismogenic source model
  and probabilistic seismic-hazard analyses in central Italy, *Bull. Seism. Soc. Am.* 96 (1) 107 –132
- Pace, B., Bocchini G.M., Boncio P., (2014) Do static stress changes of a moderate-magnitude
  earthquake significantly modify the regional seismic hazard? Hints from the L'Aquila 2009
  normal-faulting earthquake (Mw 6.3, central Italy), *Terra Nova*, 26 430-439, DOI:
  10.1111/ter.12117

697

Pace B., Visini F., Peruzza L., (2016) *FiSH*: MATLAB Tools to Turn Fault Data into Seismic
Hazard Models, *Seismological Research Letters*, DOI: 10.1785/0220150189

700

Palumbo, L., Benedetti L., Bourles D., Cinque A., and Finkel R., (2004), Slip history of the
Magnola fault (Apennines, central Italy) from 36Cl surface exposure dating: evidence for strong
earthquakes over the Holocene, *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 225, 163–176.

704

Papanikolaou I.D., Roberts G.P., and Michetti A.M., (2005) Fault scarps and deformation rates
in Lazio-Abruzzo, Central Italy: Comparison between geological fault slip-rate and GPS data,
Tectonophysics, 408, 147-176, 2005

708

709 Papanikolaou I.D. and Roberts G.P., (2007) Geometry, kinematics and deformation rates along

| 710 | the active normal fault system in the southern Apennines: Implications for fault growth, Journal |
|-----|--|
| 711 | of Structural Geology, 29, 166-188, 2007   |

Papanikolaou I.D., Van Balen R., Silva P.G., Reicherter K. (2015) Geomorphology of active
faulting and seismic hazard assessment: New tools and future challenges, Geomorphology 237 113

716

Piccardi L., Gaudemer Y., Tapponier P., and Boccaletti M., (1999) Active oblique extension in
the central Apennines (Italy): evidence from the Fucino region, Geophysical Journal
International, 139, 499-530

720

Pile J., Gouramanis C., Switzer A.D., Rush B., Reynolds I., Soria J.L.A. (2018) Can the risk of
coastal hazards be better communicated? *International Journal of Disaster Risk Reduction*, 27,
439-450

- Pucci, S., De Martini P.M., Civico R., Villani F., Nappi R., Ricci T., Azzaro R., Brunori C.A.,
  Caciagli M., Cinti F.R. et al. (2017), Coseismic ruptures of the 24 August 2016, *M<sub>w</sub>* 6.0 Amatrice
  earthquake (central Italy), Geophys. Res. Lett., 44, 2138–2147, doi:10.1002/2016GL071859.
- Reilly C., Nicol A. and Walsh J., (2016) Importance of pre-existing fault size for the evolution of
- an inverted fault system, *Geological Society, London, Special Publications*, 439, 447-463 DOI:

731 10.1144/SP439.2

732

Roberts, G.P., Michetti, A.M., (2004) Spatial and temporal variations in growth rates along
active normal fault systems: an example from the Lazio-Abruzzo Apennines, central Italy. J. *Struct. Geol.* 26, 339–376.

736

- Rosetto, T., Gehl, P., Minas, S., Galasso, G., Duffour P., Douglas, J., and Cook, O., (2016)
  FRACAS: A capacity spectrum approach for seismic fragility assessment including record-torecord variability, *Engineering Structures*, 125 337-348, doi: 10.1016/j.engstruct.2016.06.043
- Stein, S., R. Geller, and M. Liu (2012), Why earthquake hazard maps often fail and what to do
  about it, *Tectonophysics*, 562–563, 1–25.

- Stucchi M., Meletti C., Montaldo V., Crowley H., Calvi G.M., Boschi E., (2011) Seismic Hazard
  Assessment (2003-2009) for the Italian Building Code, *Bulletin of the Seimsmological Society of*
- 746 *America*, DOI: 10.1785/0120100130
- 747
- Telling J., Lyda A., Hartzell P., Glennie C., (2017) Review of Earth science research using
  terrestrial lasar scanning, *Earth Science Reviews*, 169 35-68
- 750
- 751 Valentini, A., Visini, F., and Pace, B.: (2017) Integrating faults and past earthquakes into a

| 752 | probabilistic seismic hazard model for peninsular Italy, Natural Hazards and Earth Science |
|-----|--|
| 753 | Systems, 17 (11), doi: 10.5194/nhess-17-2017-2017  |

755 Villani F, Civico R, Pucci S, Pizzimenti L, Nappi R, De Martini PM, and the Open ERERGEO

Working Group (2018), A database of the coseismic effects following the 30 October 2016
Norcia earthquake in Central Italy, *Scientific Data*, 5, doi:10.1038/sdata.2018.49

758

Visini, F., and Pace, B. (2014) Insights on a key parameter of earthquake forecasting, the
coefficient of variation of the recurrence time, using a simple earthquake simulator, *Seismological Research Letters*, 85 (3) 703–713, doi:10.1785/0220130165.

762

Wedmore W., Faure Walker J.P., Roberts G., Sammonds P., McCaffrey K., Cowie C. (2017) A
667 year record of coseismic and interseismic Coulomb stress changes in central Italy reveals the
role of fault interaction in controlling irregular earthquake recurrence intervals, *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 122 (7) 5691-5711

767

Wedmore, LNJ; (2017) Fault interaction processes and continental extension in the central
Apennines, Italy. *Doctoral thesis, UCL (University College London)*

770

Wells D.L. and Coppersmith K.J. (1994) New empirical relationships among magnitude, rupture
length, rupture width, rupture area and surface displacement, *Bulletin Seismological Society of America* 84 974-1002

Wessel, P., W. H. F. Smith, R. Scharroo, J. F. Luis, and F. Wobbe, (2013) Generic Mapping
Tools: Improved version released, *EOS Trans. AGU*, 94, 409-410

777

Wilkinson, M., Roberts, G.P., McCaffrey, K.J.W., Cowie, P.A., Faure Walker, J.P.,
Papanikolaou, I.D., Phillips, R.J., Michetti, A.M., Vittori, E., Gregory, L., et al., (2015) Slip
distributions on active normal faults measured from LiDAR and field mapping of geomorphic
offsets: an example from L'Aquila, Italy, and implications for modelling seismic moment release, *Geomorphology* 237 130-141

783

784 Full Mailing List of Each Author (alphabetically)

- 786 Joanna Faure Walker Institute for Risk & Disaster Reduction, University College London,
- 787 Gower Street, London, WC1E 6BT
- 788 Carmine Galasso Department of Civil, Environmental & Geomatic Engineering, University
- 789 College London, London, Gower Street, WC1E 6BT, UK
- Ken McCaffrey Department of Earth Sciences, Durham University, Science Labs, Durham
  DH1 3LE UK
- 792 Zoe Mildon Centre for Research in Earth Sciences, University of Plymouth, Drake Circus,
- 793 Plymouth, Devon, PL4 8AA
- 794 Gerald Roberts Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Birkbeck College, Malet Street,

795 London, WC1E 7HX, UK

- 796 Francesco Visini Istituto Nazionale di Geofisica e Vulcanologia, Via della Faggiola, 32, 56126
- 797 Pisa, Italy

798

799 <u>Tables</u>

| 800 | Table 1 | Fieldwork | data used | within   | calculations | that have | not been | nreviously | nublished |
|-----|---------|-----------|-----------|----------|--------------|-----------|----------|------------|-----------|
| 800 |         | TICIUWOIK | uala useu | wittiiii | calculations | mai nave  | not been | previously | puonsneu. |

| Fault      | UTM X  | UTM Y   | Slip vector | Slip vector | 15ka throw |
|------------|--------|---------|-------------|-------------|------------|
|            |        |         | azimuth (°) | plunge (°)  | (m)        |
| Barisciano | 369075 | 4698111 | 194         | 51          | 7.0        |
|            | 383475 | 4689190 |             |             | 6.5        |
|            | 392297 | 4679321 | 226         | 44          | 6.5        |
| Fucino     | 393474 | 4644538 | 229         | 52          |            |
|            | 393493 | 4644535 | 233         | 58          |            |
|            | 393541 | 4644520 | 209         | 56          |            |
|            | 393583 | 4644506 | 210         | 58          |            |
|            | 393594 | 4644503 | 219         | 59          |            |
|            | 393636 | 4644489 | 220         | 50          |            |
|            | 393736 | 4644447 | 218         | 40          |            |
| Liri       | 364529 | 4648418 | 168         | 65          |            |

|              | 364554 | 4648395 | 173 | 61 |                            |
|--------------|--------|---------|-----|----|----------------------------|
|              | 364628 | 4648319 | 178 | 67 | 9                          |
|              | 364633 | 4648332 | 189 | 71 |                            |
|              | 364671 | 4648294 | 197 | 64 |                            |
|              | 364683 | 4648271 | 189 | 66 |                            |
|              | 364722 | 4648213 | 177 | 58 |                            |
| Ocre         | 367652 | 4682645 | 197 | 66 |                            |
|              | 367884 | 4682479 |     |    | 6.4                        |
|              | 368647 | 4681804 | 211 | 58 |                            |
|              | 368775 | 4681715 | 213 | 46 |                            |
|              | 368838 | 4681676 | 217 | 56 |                            |
|              | 368939 | 4681589 |     |    | 2.8                        |
|              | 369008 | 4681532 | 260 | 62 |                            |
|              | 369048 | 4681494 | 255 | 55 | 6.3 ±3.0 (eye<br>estimate) |
|              | 369068 | 4681487 |     |    | 4.0                        |
|              | 369251 | 4681334 | 217 | 54 |                            |
| Roccapreturo | 392123 | 4672914 | 185 | 62 |                            |
|              | 393537 | 4671944 | 237 | 47 |                            |

|        | 393541 | 4671945 |     |    | 6.5  |  |
|--------|--------|---------|-----|----|------|--|
|        | 393554 | 4671926 | 231 | 50 |      |  |
|        | 393665 | 4671836 | 225 | 57 |      |  |
|        | 393699 | 4671804 | 215 | 55 |      |  |
|        | 393781 | 4671481 | 215 | 59 |      |  |
|        | 393785 | 4671635 | 211 | 44 |      |  |
|        | 393791 | 4671445 | 213 | 56 |      |  |
|        | 393799 | 4671404 | 212 | 53 |      |  |
|        | 393971 | 4671229 |     |    | 8.47 |  |
|        | 393995 | 4671211 | 258 | 45 |      |  |
|        | 394004 | 4671182 | 258 | 55 |      |  |
|        | 395036 | 4670693 | 253 | 52 |      |  |
| Scanno | 406678 | 4642989 | 209 | 41 |      |  |
|        | 406796 | 4643001 |     |    | 4.5  |  |
|        | 406929 | 4642938 | 217 | 47 | 10.6 |  |
|        | 407154 | 4642786 |     |    | 12.6 |  |
|        | 407413 | 4642561 | 224 | 58 |      |  |
|        | 407452 | 4642544 | 217 | 52 | 12.3 |  |
|        |        |         |     |    |      |  |

| 407462 | 4642521 | 228 | 54 |     |
|--------|---------|-----|----|-----|
| 407571 | 4642414 | 212 | 52 |     |
| 410765 | 4637903 |     |    | 4.0 |

**<u>Figure captions</u>** 



<sup>805</sup> profile, the throw-rate across the fault changes with a change in strike along the fault. In order

807 there are changes in fault strike and dip. How the strain-rate changes along the fault is shown

<sup>806</sup> to keep the strain-rate concomitant with its position along a fault, the throw-rate varies where



810 Figure 2: Fault scarps exposed at the surface in the central Italian Apennines formed since the 811 end of the LGM (Last Glacial Maximum). (a) Photograph of a post glacial scarp with example of 812 a scarp profile line. (b) Cartoon topographic scarp profile constructed across cartoon fault 813 scarp showing how the throw since the LGM is constructed. (c) Striations on limestone fault 814 plane revealing slip vector (d) Cartoon showing formation of surface scarp following the LGM, 815 the scarp is exposed because fault slip-rates are faster than erosion and sedimentation rates; the 816 LGM provides a time marker since the scarps were formed because during the glacial maximum, 817 as shown in (e), scarps were generally not exposed as erosion and sedimentation rates 818 outstripped fault slip rates. (b) adapted from Faure Walker et al. (2009), (d) and (e) adapted from Roberts and Michetti (2004) and Faure Walker (2010). 819



821 Figure 3: Map of the active faults in the central Apennines study region showing studied faults. The box in location map (a) shows the area covered by the more detailed map (b) of the 14 faults 822 823 investigated in this study. Along the 14 faults, which are highlighted in red, sites with 15ka 824 throw-rate measurements are shown with filled in circles. Bar=Barisciano, Cam=Campo Felice, 825 *Car=Carsoli*, *Fia=Fiamignano*, *Fuc=Fucino*, *Par=Parasano*, *Pes=Pescasseroli*, 826 Roc=Roccapreturo, San=San Sebastiano, Sca=Scanno, Sul=Sulmona, Tra=Trasacco. Liri and 827 Ocre also marked. Figures produced using GMT (Wessel et al., 2013).



829 Figure 4: Plots show how 15kyr strain-rates in a regular 1x2km grid change along the 830 Parasano-Pescina fault and how using degraded data for the throw profiles affects the 831 calculated strain-rates across the fault. (a) Trace of Parasano-Pescina Fault from 832 GoogleEarth<sup>TM</sup>. Circles show sites of post-glacial throw measurements, the colours correspond 833 to which models (i-iv) the throw measurements were used in. (b) Throw profiles along the fault 834 for each of the models and (c) strain-rates within 1km x 2km grid boxes along the fault. (i) 'all 835 data' uses all the data from the seven data collection sites along the fault. (ii) 'no max' uses all 836 the data except from the throw-rate data collected from the site of maximum 15ka throw. (iii-1) 837 'boxcar-max' only uses the data from the maximum throw-rate site, (iii-2) 'boxcar-mean' uses 838 the average 15ka throw, slip vector azimuth and plunge, and (iii-3) 'boxcar-min' uses only data 839 collected from the minimum throw-rate site (above zero). In each 'boxcar' scenario, the value of 840 throw is projected along the entire length of the fault until near the fault tips where the throw 841 rapidly decreases to zero. (iv) 'triangular', like 'boxcar-max' only uses the data from the

maximum throw-rate site, but in this scenario the throw-rate decreases linearly from the maximum to zero at each tip forming a triangular throw-rate profile along the fault. Error bars and dotted bar plots shown in each plot are for the 'all data' case (i). Percentage values in the boxes give the total strain-rate across the fault relative to the 'all data' case (i). This shows that degrading data by excluding a single data point (ii) or extrapolating a single throw value along a fault (iii, iv) changes calculated strain-rates across the fault.



Figure 5: Strain-rates calculated across 14 faults using different throw-rate profiles: 'all data' case (blue rectangles including  $\pm 1\sigma$ ), 'boxcar-max' (pink squares), 'boxcar-mean' (orange ovals), 'boxcar-min' (yellow diamonds) and 'triangular' (green triangles). The strain-rates calculated using simplified throw-rate profiles are shown relative to those calculated using the 'all data' throw-rate profiles. The inferred strain-rates calculated using simplified throw-rate profiles mostly lie outside  $\pm 1\sigma$  uncertainty of the 'all data' strain-rates, demonstrating that the simplified throw-rate profiles are insufficient for calculating strain-rates across faults.



857 Figure 6: Frequency-magnitude semi-log plots for  $M_w$  4.9-5.5 for the four throw-profile 858 scenarios along the Parasano-Pescina fault. The graphs compare the (i) all data sites included 859 in the 'all data' throw profile with three sets of degraded data. The three sets of degraded data 860 are created by: (ii) leaving out the maximum throw point in the 'no max' profile but including the other measurements; (iii) extrapolating the maximum throw along the whole fault in a 861 862 'boxcar-max' profile; and (iv) extrapolating throw along the fault by decreasing the maximum throw linearly to the fault tips in a 'triangular' profile. Calculated earthquake  $\geq M_w 5.1$ 863 864 recurrence intervals are 420yrs, 465yrs, 262yrs and 524yrs for cases (i) - (iv) respectively. This 865 example shows that using simplified throw-rate profiles can change calculated recurrence 866 intervals that are used to inform PSHA.



867

868 Figure 7: Effect of using simplified geometry and displacement-rate profiles on annual rates of 869 exceeding specified ground shaking intensities. The figure shows that ignoring fault bends and 870 measured dips changes calculated shaking beyond  $1\sigma$  uncertainty. (a) Maps show actual fault 871 geometry (x) and surface projection of fault assuming the depth of the seismogenic layer is 15km 872 and non-listric geometry with depth. The example site, Valle Massima, is shown as a yellow 873 circle. The  $R_{ib}$  distance to the example site is 4.6km (x) (apparent dip of fault at (x) is 55°), but 874 this distance is increased to 6.4km and 11.3km if the fault is simplified to having planar 875 geometry between the tips with the dip projected from the maximum throw-rate site (y) (55°) 876 apparent dip) and tip (z) (81° apparent dip) respectively. (b) The graphs show how the  $R_{ib}$ 

877 distance affects peak ground acceleration and spectral acceleration with distances (x), (y) and 878 (z) shown, using GMPEs from Bindi et el. (2011). (c) Annual rates of exceedance against peak 879 ground acceleration (PGA) and spectral acceleration (SA) from earthquakes on the Pescasseroli 880 fault at the given example site, Valle Massima. PGA and SA are calculated for the 'all data' 881 throw profile for fault-to-site distances  $(R_{ib})$  based on detailed fault geometry ((x), blue solid 882 line,  $\pm 1\sigma$  uncertainty shown with paler blue solid lines). Grey lines show each of the 500 883 simulation lines run for the PGA calculations. Ground shaking is further calculated using 884 simplified planar fault geometries using a straight fault trace from tip-to-tip and fault dip 885 projected from the maximum throw data site ((y), dashed line) and dip at the fault tip ((z), dotted 886 line). The simplified fault geometry source-to-site distances are also combined with recurrence 887 rates calculated for the 'boxcar-max' (pink lines) and 'triangular' (green lines) throw-profiles to 888 show the combined effect of simplifying throw profiles and using simplified geometries. In this 889 example, using a simplified throw-rate profile and planar fault geometry gives lower values of 890 calculated ground shaking intensities than using the actual values and therefore may 891 underestimate the seismic hazard to a region or town.